BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 10083708 7

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume II

Brenda Cossman &Carol Rogerson
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2017-2018

* * *

These materials are distributed solely for classroom use
students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

KE
538.5
.C672
2017
v.2
c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

JAN 1 1 2018

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

FAMILY LAW

Cases and Materials

Volume II

Brenda Cossman &Carol Rogerson
Faculty of Law
University of Toronto

2017-2018

* * *

These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students in the Faculty of Law, University of Toronto

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/familylawcases02coss

FAMILY LAW VOLUME II
Table of Contents

Page No.

IV. THE ECONOMICS OF MARRIAGE BREAKDOWN

A. The Economics of Marriage

Statistics Canada "Study: Employment patterns of families with children, 1976-2014", *The Daily,* June 24, 2015 283
Statistics Canada, "Study: Women in Canada: Women and Paid Work", *The Daily*, March 8, 2017 285
Statistics Canada, "Household Income in Canada: Key results from the 2016 census", The Daily, Sept 13, 2017 286

B. The Economic consequences of Divorce

Note: the Economic Consequences of Divorce 288
Robert Leckey, "Families in the Eyes of the Law: Contemporary Challenges and the Grip of the Past" IRPP, *Choices*, vol 15(8), July 2009, pp. 7-9, 30 289
"Incomes of Lone-parent Families" from Vanier Institute of the Family, *Profiling Canada's Families IV*, 2010, at 104-5 290
Statistics Canada, "Children living in low-income households", *Census in Brief,* Sept 13, 2017 291

V. MATRIMONIAL PROPERTY

A. Historical Overview

(a) Common Law and the Regime of Separate Property

Ontario Law Reform Commission, *Report on Family Law, Part IV: Family Property* (1974), pp. 1-2 293

(b) Trust Doctrine

LRCC, Working Paper 8, *Family Property* (1975) pp. 9-11 294
Note: The Doctrine of Resulting Trust 295
Donovan WM Waters, "The Doctrine of Resulting Trusts in Common Law Canada" (1970) 16 *McGill LJ* 187 at 188-191, 194-95, 199, 202, 205-7 295
Note: *Murdoch v Murdoch*, [1975] 1 SCR 423 and *Rathwell v Rathwell*, [1978] 2 SCR 436 298
Pettkus v Becker, [1980] 2 SCR 834 301
"Woman's Suicide Ends Fight for Rights", *Globe and Mail*, Nov 12, 1986 307
"Ontario Fee System Cited in Woman's Legal Woe", *Globe and Mail*, Nov 13, 1986 308
"Payout ends tragic story of farm wife's legal battle", *Globe and Mail*, May 26, 1989 310
Note: *Sorochan v Sorochan*, [1986] 2 SCR 38 310
Peter v Beblow, [1993] 1 SCR 980 312
Note: Constructive Trust After *Peter v Beblow* 325
Kerr v Baranow, 2011 SCC 10, [2011] 1 SCR 269 325
Notes and Questions 345
Note: *Kerr v Baranow* on Rehearing, 2012 BCSC 122 346

(c) Statutory Reform and the "Partnership Principle"

Winnifred Holland, "Reform of Matrimonial Property Law in Ontario" (1978) 1 *CJFL* 1 at 9-12. 351
John Eekelaar, "Adjustment on Divorce", ch 6 in *Family Law and Social Policy*, 2nd ed (1984), pp. 100-197 352

Martha Fineman, "Implementing Equality" [1983] *Wisconsin L Rev* 789 at 790-793, 811, 813-814, 820-826, 832-833 355

(d) Statutory Reform in Ontario: the 1978 FLRA to the 1986 FLA

Lorne Wolfson, *The New Family Law Act* (1987), pp. 2-7 358
Note: 2009 Amendments to Part I of the FLA 361

B. Part I of *Family Law Act, 1986*

(a) Application

Note: Application of the FLA to Unmarried Couples 362
Note: Application of Matrimonial Property Law to First Nations Women 363

(b) Overview of the *Family Law Act*

Ontario Law Reform Commission, *Report on Family Property* (1993), pp. 9-16 365
Law Reform Commission of British Columbia, *Working Paper on Property Rights on Marriage Breakdown* (1989), pp. 74-78, 80-83, 85-86, 91-96 368

(c) Applying the FLA: Calculating the Equalization Payment

Susanne Goodman, "Matrimonial Property", ch. 5 in LSUC, *Family Law* (Bar Admission Course Materials, 1999) 372
Skrlj v Skrlj, (1998) 2 RFL (3d) 305 (Ont. HC) 383
Note: Equalization Schemes and Bankruptcy (discussing *Schreyer v Schreyer*, 2011 SCC 35, [2011] 2 SCR 605) 387

(d) Valuation and Valuation Date Assets

(i) <u>Valuation Date</u>

Note on cases 388

(ii) <u>Determining Ownership of Assets</u>

M A Fredricks, "The Ownership Conundrum", CBAO, *Matrimonial Affairs*, May 1990 391
Korman v Korman, 2015 ONCA 578 392
Notes (including *Rawluk v Rawluk*, *Caratun v Caratun*, *Lowe v Lowe*, *Stone v Stone* and OLRC) 397

(iii) <u>Valuation</u>

Berend Hovius and Timothy Youdan, "Valuation of Property" from *The Law of Family Property* (1991), pp. 291-299 402
Black v Black (1988), 18 RFL (3d) 303 (Ont HC) 405
Susanne Goodman, "Tax Obligations and other Costs of Disposition" from LSUC, *Family Law* (Bar Admission Course Materials, 1999) 406
Note: 2009 Amendments and Notional Disposition Costs 408

(e) Deductions and Exclusions

Berend Hovius and Timothy Youdan, "Negative Net Family Property" from *The Law of Family Property* (1991), pp. 383-389 409
Note (family loans—debt or gift?; contingent liabilities; hindsight evidence) 412
Zavarella v Zavarella, 2013 ONCA 720 412
Note: *Jackson v Jackson*, 2013 ONSC 7884 417
Folga v Folga (1986), 2 RFL (3d) 358 (Ont HC .) 417
Note: *Nahatchewitz v Nahatchewitz* (1999), 1 RFL (5^{th}) 395 (Ont CA) 419
Note: *Linov v Williams,* 2007 CanLII 7407 (Ont SC) 420
Berend Hovius, "The Family Home: Legal Treatment in Ontario" (2010) 29 *CFLQ* 119 at 124-27 ("Special Treatment of a Matrimonial Home in the Calculation of NFPs") 420
Note (differences in treatment of DOM property and excluded property) 422
Black v Black (1988), 18 RFL (3d) 303 (Ont HC) 422

Note: Proposed Amendments to the FLA re Exclusions, Deductions and Special Treatment of the Matrimonial Home 423
Some Notes on Tracing Excluded Property (discussing *Oliva v Oliva* (1998), 12 RFL (3d) 334 (Ont CA), *Townshend v Townshend*, 2012 ONCA 868 and *Martin v Sansome*, 2014 ONCA 14) 424

(f) Continued Relevance of Constructive Trust

Note 426
Rawluk v Rawluk, [1990] 1 SCR 70 427
Note: Reverse Constructive Trust 433
Note: OLRC 1993 Recommendations 434
Martin v Sansome 2014 ONCA 14 435
Berend Hovius, "Unjust Enrichment Claims by Spouses upon Marriage Breakdown: Achieving a Measure of Fairness or Causing Uncertainty and Complexity" (2014), 33 *CJFL* 140 at 170-172 441

(g) Sample NFP Problems

Berend Hovius, "Sample Problems" from Hovius, *Family Law Cases and Materials* (1992), pp. 365-366 444

(h) Departures from Equalization

(i) Short Marriage

Berend Hovius, "Unequal Sharing of Net Family Properties under Ontario's *Family Law Act*" (2009) 27 *CFLQ* 147 at 177-182 ("Short Period of Cohabitation") 445
Pope v Pope (1999), 42 OR (3d) 514 (Ont CA) 447
Gomez v McHale, 2016 ONCA 318 451

(ii) Debts and Depletion of Assets (and Extent of Court's Power under s. 5(6))

Berend Hovius, "Unequal Sharing of Net Family Properties under Ontario's *Family Law Act*" (2009) 27 *CFLQ* 147 at 170-177 ("Debts Incurred Recklessly or in Bad Faith" and "Intentional or Reckless Depletion of NFP") 453
Note: *Consentino v Consentino*, 2015 ONSC 271 457
Von Czieslik v Ayuso, 2007 ONCA 305 458

(iii) Unequal Contributions

LeBlanc v LeBlanc [1988] 1 SCR 217 464
Kim Zarzor, "A New Day in a Hard Life", *The Toronto Star*, Feb 16, 1988 467
Berdette v Berdette (1988), 14 R.F.L. (3d) 398 (Ont. H.C.) 469
Notes: *McInnis v McInnis,* unreported, Gen Div 1990; *Martin v Martin*, 2007 2007CarswellOnt 683 (Ont SCJ), and *Dillon v Dillon*, (2010) ONSC 5858 473
Berend Hovius, "Unequal Sharing of the Economic Gain During Marriage in Ontario: An Update" (2012) 31 *CFLQ* 155 at 170-171 ("Disparity in Contributions Before the Valuation Date") 474
Note: Tort Awards for Spousal Misconduct 475

(iv) Effect of Special Rules Relating to the Matrimonial Home

Ward v Ward, 2012 ONCA 462 476

(v) Post-Separation Conduct and Anticipated Future Needs

Note: *Merklinger v Merklinger*, (1992), 43 RFL (3d) 109 (Ont Gen Div), aff'd. (1996), 26 RFL (4th) 7 (Ont CA); *Tamitegama v. Tamitegama,* unreported, 1993, Ont Gen Div. 478
Berend Hovius, "Unequal Sharing of Net Family Properties under Ontario's *Family Law Act*" (2009) 27 *CFLQ* 147 at 190-192 ("Abdication of Responsibilities & Other Conduct after Valuation Date") 479

(vi) Post-Separation Changes in the Value of Property

Serra v. Serra, 2009 ONCA 105 481
Berend Hovius, "Unequal Sharing of the Economic Gain During Marriage in Ontario: An Update" (2012) 31 *CFLQ* 155 at 174-176 ("Changes in Property Value After the Valuation Date") 492
Notes and Questions 493
OLRC, *Report on Family Property* (1993), pp 68-71 494

VI. THE MATRIMONIAL HOME

A. Introduction and Overview of Part II of the Family Law Act

Berend Hovius, "The Family Home: Legal Treatment in Ontario" (2010), 29 *CFLQ* 119 at 119 ("Introduction") 496
Lorne Wolfson and Barry Corbin, "The Matrimonial Home Under the FLA" (1987), 2 *Money and Family Law*, pp. 1-8 496
Note: *Debora v Debora* (2006), 33 RFL. (6th) 252 (Ont CA) 499
MacFarland v MacFarland, 2009 CarswellOnt 2949 (Ont SCJ) 499

B. Orders for Exclusive Possession

Berend Hovius, "The Family Home: Legal Treatment in Ontario" (2010), 29 *CFLQ* 119 at 141-48, 150-54, 156 ("Orders for Exclusive Possession") 504
Pifer v Pifer (1986), 3 RFL (3d) 167 (Ont Dist Ct) 508
Hill v Hill (1987), 10 RFL (3d) 225 (Ont Dist Ct) 509
Menchella v. Menchella, 2012 ONSC 6304, 2012 CarswellOnt 13842 512
Note: Groups Excluded from the Protections of Part II of the FLA 514
Berend Hovius, "The Family Home: Legal Treatment in Ontario" (2010), 29 *CFLQ* 119 at 119-124 ("Occupation Rights of Common-Law Partners") 515
Note: Restraining Orders 516
Justice Geraldine Waldman, "The What and the Why of the Proposed Integrated Domestic Violence Court", CBAO, 22 (2) *Matrimonial Affairs*, November 2010 517
Berend Hovius, "The Family Home: Legal Treatment in Ontario" (2010), 29 *CFLQ* 119 at 157-160 ("Orders at Trial") 520